

# Session 6: Contestations over Stakeholder Roles in Islamic Bioethical Discourse Opening Lecture



@initiative4IM



## essions

#### Modules

- O Session 1:
  - Introduction
- Session 2:
  - Research Methods, Outputs & Producer Roles in Islamic Bioethics
- Session 3:
  - An Introduction to Islamic Moral Epistemology
- Session 4:
  - Islamic Law & Bioethics
- O Session 5:
  - Character Development and Islamic Bioethics

- Session 6:
  - Contestations over Stakeholder Roles in Islamic Bioethical Discourse
- O Session 7:
  - Islamic Bioethics of Brain Death & End-of-Life Healthcare Ethics
- O Session 8:
  - Islamic Bioethics of Organ Donation and Transplantation
- O Session 9:
  - Islamic Bioethics Ethics of Abortion & Human Reproduction
- Session 10:
  - Islamic Bioethics: A Review

### Why Important?

- Islamic Bioethics is
  - A multi- inter- trans- disciplinary discourse seeking to provide best approximations of <u>Islamic</u> moral guidance to biomedicine
- Producers
  - Bring a certain disciplinary perspective
  - Proffer guidance with a particular primary audience in mind
  - May see part for the whole
  - → We must recognize and account for limitations of their ethical gaze/analysis
- Guidance
  - Wholly dependent on an accurate conceptualization of the ethical problem space
  - Different audiences read different material and uptake differently
    - Figh → Policy implementation; Figh to practice patterns and sociology/theology of practice
  - → We must be able to recognize missing relevant vantage-points or concerns



#### Focus Questions

#### **Self-Reflection Questions**

- What is an expert hierarchy for Islamic bioethical deliberation based on the readings?
- Who speaks for Islamic bioethics and what makes their pronouncements Islamic?

Focus questions relate to discrete knowledge found in the readings and lectures



Self-reflection questions are about the field and how it may relate to your practice

#### Insights into the Materials: Contestations over Roles

- o Hamdy, S. 2013. *Reframing Islamic Bioethics*. Contending Modernities Project. University of Notre Dame.
- o Mobin-Uddin, Asma. 2019. *Journal of Islamic Faith and Practice. Practicing Clinical Bioethics: Reflections from the Bedside.* doi:10.18060/23275
- o Padela, AI. 2015. Muslim Perspectives on the American Healthcare System: The Discursive Framing of "Islamic" Bioethical Discourse. Die Welt des Islams.55:413-447
- O Ghaly, M. Biomedical Scientists as Co-Muftis: Their Contribution to Contemporary Islamic Bioethics. Die Welt des Islams.55:286-311
- O Stodolsky, M. V. Y., & Kholwadia, M. A. 2021. *A jurisprudential (Uṣūlī) framework for cooperation between Muslim jurists and physicians and its application to the determination of death.* In Medicine and Shariah: A Dialogue in Islamic Bioethics, edited by AI Padela. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press

#### Who are the main actors: Producers?

Producers	Primary Roles	Textual Outputs	
Islamic jurists	To serve Muslims by enabling their continued adherence to the faith	Fatātoā     Judicial opinions     (qararāt)	TABLE 1.2 Continued
Muslim clinicians	To serve as biomedical experts helping jurists understand the biomedical science and context that surround bioethical questions     To serve as conduits of Islamic bioethical Rowledge to patients who might ask for religiously informed opinions on medical treatments and decisions	Peer-reviewed journal articles	Producers  Islamic/Muslim bioethicists
Academic Islamic/ religious studies experts	<ul> <li>To study and address dialectics between Islam and biomedicine by analyzing the literature and drawing on aspects, of the Islamic tradition</li> </ul>	Normative essays     Books and book chapters     Peer-reviewed journal articles	Muslim health professional organizations
Social scientists	To describe how Muslims engage with bioethical questions     To focus on the negotiation of Islamic values and identities in healthcare systems and within individual societies	Books     Peer-reviewed journal articles     Policy reports and briefs	Juridical academies

Producers	Primary Roles	Textual Outputs
Islamic/Muslim bioethicists	To serve on clinical and research ethics committees, as well as bioethics advisory groups, offering Islamic and Muslim ethical insights To author scholarly articles and papers to advance the field of Islamic bioethics	Books     Peer-reviewed journal articles     Normative essays
Muslim health professional organizations	To convene scholars to deliberate about bioethical questions To generate bioethics primers and policies	Books     Articles     Judicial opinions (qararāt)
Juridical academies	To bring jurists together to render Islamic ethico-legal opinions	Books     Fatāwā     Judicial opinions     (qararāt)
State authorities	To use Islamic ethics and law as sources in crafting policies and laws	Policies     Laws

What discipline & vantage-point is the author coming from?

